

GOVERNANCE IN PAKISTAN: AN ANALYSIS OF THE ISSUES AND CHALLENGES

Maham Razaq

Visiting Lecturer Department of Political Science GC Women University Sialkot

mahamrazzaq298@yahoo.com

Dr. Farzana Zaheer Syed

Assistant Professor Department of Political Science Higher Education Department Lahore

fazanasyed@gmail.com

AD Sajanka

Visiting Lecturer Pakistan Studies GC University Faisalabad

Dr Umer Javaid Ghumman

PhD Political Science Umer8992@gmail.com

Abstract

Governance is generally defined as an exercise of power or authority exercised by the elected political elites for the well-being of their State citizens. Governance is also considered a process whereby public institutions carry out public affairs, manage public resources and pledge the comprehension of the human rights. Pakistan is a federal state with diverse population. The governance remained an issue since the inception. The Political instability and irresponsible political elite' behavior towards governance are the major issues in Pakistan. The study has aim to analyze the governance issues and challenges in Pakistan. A qualitative research approach with analytical method used to find out the answers of the research questions. It is find out that corruption, undemocratic regimes and lack of accountability has weakened the governance skeleton in Pakistan. Pakistan needs to implement the World Bank's given criteria for good governance for the protection of the basic human rights of its citizens.

Keywords: Governance, Good governance, Environmental governance, Transparency, Democracy

Introduction:

"The biggest determinant in our lives is culture, where we are born, what the environment looks like. But the second biggest determinant is probably governance, good governance or a certain kind of governance makes a huge difference in our lives" - Nicolas Berggruen

The concept of "governance" is not new for government. The word earlier used in 14th century that was derived from Greek word "kubernaein". Primarily the meaning was not different as the terms referring the activity of the government, manners of the process of the government (Bhasin, 2010).

In the mid of 16th century, government indicated a system or process by which something is ruled or governed and in the beginning of the 18th century it more involved to get the meaning of a 'ruling power' or 'governing authority'. So the word governance steadily became marginalized at that time and in the 19th century it was considered to reflect an emerging archaism. However the word governance has been used in different perspectives (van der Meulen, 2021).

The notion of global governance is a way of supportive or accommodating leadership which brings near a state government multidimensional public organizations and civil society to get of common purposes or goals. It must be broad or wide-ranging, active and capable for becoming effective and for lessening national and sectorial borders and interests. Global governance should not be used hard power, but it should be soft. It should be more political, democratic and integrated rather than bureaucratic, authoritarian and specialized (Weiss, 2000).

- However the idea or term global governance is not new. Global governance as a model remained dominated in 20th century regarding concrete and practical models. In the early 20th century London was the central point of worldwide finance and trade. In the mid of 20th century Euro-American Alliance had become stronger but the center had moved west world through the Atlantic. At

the end of 18th century this side-line was getting strength. New local and even worldwide powers had emerged to encounter the old, but governance process unsuccessful to keep up with these changes. There are four changes for global governance which are imported for development (Imran M. a., 2018).

- The varying characters of international governance and where it is situated.
- The rights geopolitics for the development reducing from the emergence of the 'Rest' involving BRICS, and the conversion of the worldwide development plan because of its growth.
- Third worlds reorientation the customary or out-dated constituency of the right to improvement or development and the price of a more stricken hegemonic kind of the third world.
- The worldwide crisis of ends and means, the most dominance and prominent crisis as they are financial and economic on global level that erupt in 2008, stress that the idea of development that is only rights Friendly civilized and contributory and then neoclassical cannot be base of development. However must estimate with the limits to development itself and along with the effects of such a methodology for human rights (Rajagopal, 2013).

Governance is commonly considered as the practice of political economic and administrative power in the private and public circles to handle country's matters at all stages for the improvement of quality of life of the public. It is on-going process where different views and hopes are fulfilled by understanding and patience in a passion of collective or supportive action for the common interest of the larger whole. It has three extents:

- The political administration;
- The schemes and process for practicing power;
- The capability of governments

This research tried to find out some factors regarding legislation and execution which is a cause of miss or mal governance practices in Pakistan. There are three prominent factors of governance in Pakistan:

- Firstly is devolution to the local government status,
- Secondly, the effects of corruption and immoral exercises as barrier to good governance and as a reason of the unsuccessfulness of institutional organizations with specific references to the procedure of arrangement,
- Lastly financial and social cost of mal-governance. Government officers and senior politicians know well how the government and its machinery participated in the affairs of state.

Further, federation holds the control on the resource management because provinces had not able to divide them equally or obtain the exact value of money. Unsuccessful systems and procedures frustrate the hard work or honest officials; the public face such political and bureaucratic system. That is unaccountable and unresponsive to the needs; policies are the barrier for entrepreneur because they are contradictory to each other, are counter procedure, planned to help in increasing corruption and are as persistent as the varying winds. Pakistan and provinces have to change the way of governing and executive especially in the context of macroeconomic organization (Asghar, 2013).

Pakistan is facing a lot of governance issues at present, and all these issues have become burden or barrier in the way of smooth and maintainable progress of the country. Pakistan is a 124 rank amongst 144 countries on the index of effectiveness

according to World Economic Forum as it is based on points as; Institutions 115, macroeconomic and economic environment 139, infrastructure 116, primary education and health 117, training and higher education 124, goods market proficiency 97, labour market proficiency 130, financial market progress 73, technological eagerness 97, market size 30, business complexity 78, and modernization 77(Asghar, 2013).

This depicts a tragic image of governance at state and global level. It is a requirement of Pakistan to reconsider its scheme and planning related to efficiency and success of governance at all levels with a special attention for growth and progress in long term as well as short term. It is an authenticated fact that bad governance directs to corruption in a variety of ways.

The idea 'governance' required to be explain first as there are various explanations of this concepts. At next step is that it can be estimated for achieving the anticipated purposes at state or national level. This procedure contains three factors in shaping political, economic, administrative and social decisions which influence the public. Lifestyle of any society is determined by the governance at it organize. Itself to form and enforce decision (politics) intercede variances (public goods) and practice authorized rights and responsibilities (public administrations).

Overall, governance involves the laws, institutions and exercises that fixed limit and afford in incentive. It activates at all level of human creativity or initiatives in a state and its influence in too for whole parts of society. It is the obligation of country that it produces capable political and legitimate environment while civil society assists social and political contact. It is observed in Pakistan that the idea of governance generally rotates around rules and order position in the country, while it is a more inclusive nation that contains handling the matters of the country i.e. social, political and economic(Asghar, M. U, 2013). All the governance issues in Pakistan based on some fundamental legislature and executive elements, which have participated to miss governance or mal-governance in Pakistan. But issues of governance are not limited as there more basic issues, predictable governance policies. Especially in the filled of finance (taxation) and regulatory policy (supply and money requirement) rule and laws (racial and terrorist disturbance) and transfer of power to local governments that are the big issues for Pakistan. Last governments introduced many reforms regarding legislation but still immense issues and challenges exist for the politicians and bureaucracy. Weakness and flaws discussed in the policy and executive by many studies as these weaknesses are the major issues for Pakistan.

Provinces received autonomous after 18th Amendment under 1973 constitution of Pakistan, decentralizing the basic concern for the providing education, water and sanitation, health, roads and transport as well as agriculture services. The practical devolution obviously completed by significant political, financial and administrative variances at national and provincial levels (Syed, 2020).

In spite all of the administrative devolution exist the most argumentative circle, which still follows the way of pro-independence. In hiring junior level all provinces are more self-governing, while central services still under the pressure of the Central Superior Services (CSS).

Requisites of Governance

There are five main elements that assist to drive all owner governance levels.

- Responsibility (shaping government capability)
- Contribution (participatory growth procedure)
- Certainty (legitimate framework)

- Transparency (information directness)

Politician and bureaucracy of Pakistan generally used the concept of governance. It is essential to clarify this term. According to the World Bank's report there is no powerful or authenticated harmony around a particular definition of governance or organizational quality (Kaufmann, 2011).

Some definitions are much extensive that they come up almost every aspects, like the explanation of laws, implementation machineries and institutions while few hardly focus on public division management challenges and issues, involving the given definition of world bank in 1992, like the way in which authority is practiced in the management of a state's economic and societal resources for growth or development ingredients of governance are further clarified by the world bank as they are given below:

- The procedure through which governments are nominated examined and replaced.
- The ability of the government to efficiently frame and enforced strong policies and strong policies.
- The esteem of the citizens and the conditions of the institutions that rule or direct economic and societal relations among them.

The basics of 'good governance' lie on the rule of liberty of thought and speak, and from discrimination and from starvation, equalitarianism all have the similar rights, equity no one is differentiate against, justice; morality and transparency; and responsibility (Singh, 2005).

Issues of Governance in Pakistan

There is common consent amongst economists, planners and policy-makers which is the greatest and best tool to maintain development in coming times to ensure effective governance in the scheme. For the active and effective governance, there can be several planes in civil services, refining and increasing the capability of institutions participated in policy shaping to set coherent policies, emerging and sponsoring for policy reforms.

Problems of governance in Pakistan begin with the ancient induction system that has been working for centuries as an issue of status quo policy. Both the provincial service commission and Federal public service commission requires reviewing the selection procedure regarding the conditions of reference for the job. As these all institutions are appointing illegible persons for the important posts in the country. In extensive range, a study considers on governance problems along with four wide ranging circles, as they are institutional capability, effectiveness, management and legislative framework (Ismail ,2010).

There exists concisely discussion, like firstly focus on constitution that explains the limits along with state organs institutions, organizations and persons can direct and hence, deals problems concerned to the state and its public. The second one is the institutional capability, which recognizes the capacity of state players as institutions, organizations and agents to detect policies, certify consistency and harmonization and confirms compliance and their development.

Appointment method performs significant role in the working of the system as the whole system built upon appointment of qualified and capable. Bureaucracy is not disqualified but most of them are misfit to their relevant institutions regarding their academic record. This trend disturbs the system in long run. So resultantly, the systems get decline or could not offer or perform professionally and the rest of the parts too collapse in their services.

No doubt economic development as a single factor does not certify the accessibility of public goods to all the public. Water sanitation, health, education and the availability of justice are best forms or examples of public goods, while their use through individuals or by one group shrink their accessibility to others.

Governance narrates to the organization of all such procedures which, in any society, explains the environment that allows and supports people to elevate their ability status, on the other hand offer such chances to feel their energy and power expand the set of available options.

Governance has been linked for very short time regarding institutional and human capability for the betterment the livelihoods of people, effectiveness or competitiveness of business, the provision of fundamental public services, and dependence in monitoring institutions. As a segment of extensive reform and very agendas, Pakistan has also been growing and reviewing its institutions framework and implementations. Currently, Pakistan is facing energy, social, and financial crisis, which show the significant role of government in allocation the public interest of service supply and people goods.

The country arrangement requires new attention through the government in the direction of institutions, strategies and tools which assist government to supply what the common citizens and commerce requirement and assume. It too points out the central parts, where the attention of government is certain and variations may be required. Good governance is an element which cannot be controlled in isolation. Specially, Pakistan requires to realize and measure its capacity that how it can get better its capability to estimate and handle dangers, and response firstly to typical issues or problems in altering environments in the area as well as in world. Because of the global structure of these problems, it is not practicable to perform at the state level in a private manner, like Pakistan grips vital geo-strategic status.

Research Objectives

- To highlight the significance of Governance
- To Analyse the issues of governance in Pakistan
- To analyze the challenges faced by the governments in governance process
- To recommend policy measures for good governance in Pakistan

Research Questions

1. How (why) governance is a significant part of government?
2. What are the major issues of governance in Pakistan?
3. Why (how) the governance process remained a challenge in Pakistan?
4. What policy measures required for good governance in Pakistan?

Improved Harmonization at all Levels of Governance

Government professionally can handle the relations for improving the level of governance. This is a main problem in public governance and then nearly all states are decentralized on one hand or the other hand as the similar case with Pakistan. Pakistan keeps three levels of management like local, provincial and federal government. Central government requires the cooperation of local governments for achieving its strategies or goals. At the same time, for performing their duties, the local governments frequently need the association or harmony of the central governments (Jafri, 2014).

The energy, financial and political and political issues strengths the search for people expenses productivity all the stages of government in Pakistan, which had demanded better harmonization amid federal and local government. This upgraded collaboration and harmony can develop governance performance in the country. It is

obvious that active organization of government relationships parallel (between central and ministries) and vertically (among provisional and local levels) demands lessening sequence or chain of breaches.

These breaches derived from the facts that one stage of government will base on the other one for skills, resources and information irregularity in information proved to be a serious threat or challenge in the policy production procedures various levels of government hold various kinds of information on the same issues. For instance, intellect sharing amongst the rule implements institutions and agencies are decentralized or shared regularly. This shortcoming causes toward the absence and lack of harmony between the institutions, consequent in bad governance in rule implementing agencies and institutions. Filling this gape is one of the main problems of multilevel governance. A short description of present gaps is given as following:

- Information Breach
- Capacity Breach
- Financial Breach
- Executive Breach
- Policy Breach
- Connecting the gaps for the Global governance
- Financial sustainability
- Internal dispute and country power

Information Breach

The information irregularities at different stages of the government are major issue that offers public policy, enforcing and shaping policy is a major characteristic. So these information irregularities badly affect the policy procedure, causing the bad policy decisions, that consequently the bad governance (Chaudhry, 2009).

Ability Breach

Capacity gap produces because lack of human resources and infrastructure. This emerges when there is not sufficient human awareness or infrastructural assets present to continue works, irrespective of the stage of a government. Pakistan requires taking serious capability building methods to improve its human and financial capital to overcome the challenges of modern world. In the case of insufficient capability of both human and capital it is not possible offer the people goods on merit (Khalid, 2020).

Financial Breach

Financial gap is the variance between expenditure and revenue. It shows the variances amid expenditures and revenue at all stages of government requires fulfilling their duties. As the financial gap expands their provincial governments expect from the federal structure for founding's, which shows a straight development on upper stages of government to get fund to meet the needs (Jensen,1998).

Executive Breach

Executive gaps emerges when public management is ruled by inexperienced or non-technical officers in contrast to their work description unsuitable person for any post can give fruitful output as he is misfit for the system. Institutions cannot perform well with such type of officers.

Policy Breach

Policy gaps also caused bad governance when politicians and bureaucrats made such policies or laws which lack the requirements and demand of the public. For instance, such politicians make policies related to health that never get treatment from local level. Similarly provincial governments are deprived from the policy

procedure and federal government dictates rules and policies from top to bottom. It finally harms the good governance as policy gap creates amongst the policy makers.

Plug the Breaches for Good Governance

It has been experienced that all the countries of the world are making progress by using a wide range of mechanism to fill these spaces or gaps, develop the multi-level policy making procedure, and equal or finish the differences and gaps which emerge during the provision of jobs and resources. Professional and experts are handling the public management as a side case discipline while public policy has arisen as a man discipline along with people goods and their allocation to the public (Chouhdry,2009).

- **Financial Sustainability**

Good governance demands financial sustainability. As financial indicators are represent the country progress and power for more growth. Financial policies as economic policies and regulatory policy are understood to be the two basic factors of the national finance that control and enhance two processes of trade and investment both on state level and outside the state. Pakistan desperately is having the requirement of financial sustainability to contest with international markets. Energy issues have spoiled the economic sustainability in the most previous years and, if all these problems remain and not manage seriously then they will damage the economy in future (Chouhdry, 2009).

Internal Disputes and Country Power

In the previous years the polarization of society with regional, communal, ethnic, religious lines has been completed through social values by which different groups had survived together in a pluralistic society. Internal Conflicts and State Power Communities had been living together in a pluralistic society.

The social polarization is now powered by barbarity and numerous farms of disputer which have come to the point that browbeat not only the credibility of political institutes but brings to question that opposes not merely Pakistan but many other south Asian countries. Since the seventeenth century, in South Asia, the vitals of capital accumulation and process of repossession of economic reserve are political centralization and encumbrance of state funded cultural homogeneity. These two interconnected processes demand an affiliated market in the state and developing engrossment and centralization of economic and political power under control of ruling elite. During Mughal era lack of communication and experts gave liberty to local markets. However, the colonial period showed great reserve with along with its shift abroad comprehensively organized by the colonial state. This demands a pretty much affiliation and orientation of domestic economy for expert of elementary goods and also a related centralized state constitution that could control local elite for the service of urbanite political and economic interests. Then in post-colonial period, the fragile elite inherit the parliamentary models of west minister variety with approach to compulsive colonial state apparatus.

The elite introduced the procedure of economic growth with the selection of private enterprise. The following three essential characters which have a great influence on relation between state and civil society are the root causes of capitalist growth process in the post-colonial period in south Asia countries. The national economy begins to be progressively affiliated with world capitalist economy by way of market system. The constitution inherited by these economies from colonial period made them indispensable exporters of primary products. An Increasing in the affiliation with the World Capitalist system resources transferred to the metropolitan economy. It happened by towering terms of trade, noncompetitive prices of imported

technologies, paybacks and accounts servicing. Hence a large part of profit in the local economy were departed to urbanite economy simply by and working of market system.

Economic growth was envisioned as unmatched issuance of high yielding benefits, ending in increasing interpersonal and inters regional income inequities. The 40% of population persisted to be under privileged by the basic necessities of food, home, health and education (Sheikh, 2020). The state had a lean reserve because of taking tax base and large resource transfer abroad by the market system. Aside from this, the elite interests of the state stopped the forceful resource armament drive. Hence the state is ineffectual to control poverty.

The inherited British system i.e. centralized administrative system and political govern ship from a diverse ethnic, linguistic and cultural groups are the consequence of centralized administrative system inherited from British raj and of political govern from lacking foundation. Hence under these circumstances, the participation of large divisions of society is repudiated by the elite administrative and political system, in making divisions affecting their economic and social existence. The underprivileged sections of society were answered by arguing their ethnic, linguistic and regional identities owing to deficiency of valid chances of comprehension in exiting institutions and unequal development of four duds.

By such predomination, they could make use of easy going controversial charge to prepare militancy and therefore exert political pressure. Over the years, the ruling elite has been failed to solve the issue arising from either delivering goods to the poor or involving them in economic and political decision making due to this crisis as mentioned above. Preferable this should be said that the elite have taken the submission of sub-nationalism as law and have tried to use compulsive force to oppose this. This is not considered as a mere 'problem' but lays increasing importance to security agencies in structuring state power.

Challenges to Governance Process

Pakistan having demand to analyze and review the performance of government and its capabilities to rule the present law and order, financial, energy and demographic crisis, that have straight effects on governance exercises in Pakistan. The worth elasticity and efficiency of public governance are vital minimum to Pakistan's capacity to solve future problems and challenges. Particularly, it is highlighted that Pakistan's government needs to make new policy strategies and tools or reform old ones completely in new procedures, with the determinations to re-think and maintain financial activity, enhance new procedures in the system and make strong the outline for better working trade markets in the state.

Similarly both fiscal crisis and law and order situation have demonstrated the significance of governance system. In this present world, governments try to be fast in answering to policy problems concerning the national interest, as the scenario among the countries is so challenging and competitive. The public got more and more awareness through media. So consequently, citizens want quick answer as well as quick solutions to meet the needs of people. On the other side development in technology also elevated citizens' hopes regarding new processes to communicate and make sure public services from the government. Information as people have accessed to it, motivates the public to analysis governments' presentation with policy performance and democratic performance. Democratic performance means the level to which government decision making procedure is along with democratic rules and laws, while policy presentation means government's capability to offer positive consequences for society by public policy. So at the same level publics hopes are

aggregating, in spite of the reality that resources are decreasing as they are limited to meet the needs of public. As previous budget of fiscal year 2013-2014 shows the serious consequences for the state and society in Pakistan. In such situation, the effectiveness and efficacy of public department have become the requirement of the time and the achievement of government rests on it (Hussain, 1993).

Mandatory Capabilities for Lessening Challenges in Pakistan

The diverse and a lot of issues confronting Pakistan government carries into serve focus the needs for government to consider and perform in the long term, to cooperate globally as well as with national government and to examine various information because of their complicated features. To solve these issues or crisis, government will require expert staff with the perfect skills. Pakistan will too require quick co-ordination and the availability of high level information which can be used in decision making procedure government requires to improve new capabilities as well as to stay of reviewing current reforms: as how do quick or suitable terms and conditions for success?

Analysis of the Potential Challenges in Pakistan

Governance is facing variety of challenges as energy crisis, political instability terrorism and environmental change, which will need long term planning and harmonization to solve them. These issues and crisis highlight the significance and sustained need for developed management in the organization, detection, and assessment of policies formation to secure the people interests. Because of short term electoral and political obligations, government observe it hard to suitable forecast and handle the growing circles of dangers, or to suitable assess and control governance issues and chances. Policy management and predicting within public management has tries to focus more on medium in spite of long standing, along high standard progress of work or strategy reports highly connected to the electoral process.

Management and Collaboration

Governance issues are mostly parallel in nature, influencing multiple features of government actions. Resultantly, a solution to these problems needs collaboration across ministries. There are shortcomings; however it is difficult for managers to pay adequate consideration to all basic people in long term. International and cross departmental organizations, efficiency can be limited in spite of usefulness, if definite front-line control, service supply agents and those contributed in directory control are omitted from deliberations. Though, growing collaboration may not only need structural modifications however also cultural variations to produce an environment and motivations favourable to collaboration: it is vital high level services leadership for facilitating these variations, as separate groups of managers are cultivated by some countries.

Constructing the Exact Skills: Appealing and Maintaining the Suitable Staff

Many countries have enforced new reforms to enhance their capabilities to build right and high caliber staff as it is very essential for countries performance. Similarly governments are handling demographic variations both on external and internal level which can influence their capability to supply services and goods.

Integrating Policy Making and Enforcement

Policy making and enforcement of policy are two separate things but both are essential for a policy or for making program successful or achieving its purposes. Unfortunately the separation of both breaks the flow of information, as often causing badly planned policies and imperfect or limited enforcement.

Pakistan having need of both steps for shaping policies, which called offer a structure for good governance exercises in the country. As there are many factors like

violation of merit, corruption and jobs issues are barriers in the practice of good governance.

Conclusion:

Governance is the practice of a government coming together to take decisions to govern a State through elected political government with the support of bureaucracy. It performs some obligations as supervision, strategic planning, decision-making and monetary planning that fall beneath governance activities. The process of governance required democratic emancipation in the political and bureaucratic system. In Pakistan case since the inception it remained problematic or made consciously problematic to destabilize the country. These problems underlying the concern is the malfunctioning to extend a working healthy relationship with the bureaucracy and to gratify executive bodies that if they take decisions they may not encounter disciplinary action from any forum which is disgruntled with their decisions. In Pakistan there are complaints and a sense that there is inclusive lack of leadership at top. It furthermore indulges bureaucrats in a state where they do not identify where to revolve. Same as Political leaders change and same new leaders dislocate the civil servants according to their desires. The disappointment made them dishearten to continue their job with regards. Political governments on the other hand also remain busy with opposition and completing their tenures. They consider threat to their government and continuously engaged to make it stable without performance. Unfortunately Pakistan governance issues can only minimize if the government follow the World Bank proposed criteria for good governance to all the States.

References:

- Asgar, M. U. (2013). Governance Issues in Pakistan: Suggested Action Strategy. *ISSRA PAPERS*, 113.
- Bhasin, M. (2010). Corporate governance in the Asian countries. *African Journal of Business Management*, 4(10), 1964-1971.
- Chouhdry, I. S., Malik, S., Khan, K. N., & Rasool, S. (2009). Factors affecting good governance in Pakistan: An empirical analysis. *European Journal of Scientific Research*, 35(3), 337-346.
- Hussain, M. A. (1993). *Pakistan: Problems of governance*. Delhi: New Delhi: Konark Publishers.
- Imran, M. A. (2018). "Good Governance in Pakistan: Challenges and Recommendations". *International Journal* , 01-11.
- Ismail, Z. H. (May 17 2010). "Some issues of governance in Pakistan." .
- Jafri, A. R., & Faisal, F. (2014). Problems and Prospects of Good Governance in Pakistan. *New Horizons*, 8(2), 81.
- Jensen, E. (1998). Good governance and Pakistan's economic prospects for progress. *Pakistan Journal of Applied Economics*, 14(1/2), 63-87.
- Kaufmann, D. A. (2011). "The worldwide governance indicators: methodology and analytical issues. *Hague Journal on the Rule of Law* 3, no. 2, 220-246.
- Khalid, I. (2020). Politics of Federalism in Pakistan: Problems and Prospects. *South Asian Studies*, 28(1).
- Rajagopal, B. (2013). "Global governance: old and new challenges.". *Realizing the Right to*, 169-178.
- Report, S. (n.d.). *Achieving Good Governance: Some Conceptual Issues*. . I-Saps.
- Seidman, Robert B., Ann Seidman, NalinAbeysekere, and Judy Seidman. "Assessing Legislation: A Manual for Legislators." Private edition (2003).
- Sheikh, S., Iqbal, R., Qureshi, R., Azam, I., & Barolia, R. (2020). Adolescent food insecurity in rural Sindh, Pakistan: a cross-sectional survey. *BMC nutrition*, 6(1), 1-9.
- Singh, A. e. (2005). *Administrative reforms: Towards sustainable practices*. India: AGE Publications India.

- Smith, B. C. *Good Governance and Development*. 3. Macmillan International Higher Education, 2007.
- Steffens, Anouk. *Is the good governance approach to combating corruption effective or should other approaches such as good enough governance be considered: Guatemala: a case study*. Bachelor's thesis, 2017.
- Syed, F. Z., Mubariz, S., & Shah, S. N. J.(2020) Provincial Demands for Self-rule and Shared-rule under the 18th Amendment in Pakistan: An Assessment. *Journal of Politics and International Studies* Vol. 6, No. 1, January–June 2020, pp.149– 163.
- van der Meulen, J. (2021). Seigneurial governance and the state in late medieval Guelders (14th–16th century). *Continuity and Change*, 36(1), 33-59.
- Weiss, T. G. (2000). Governance, good governance and global governance: conceptual and actual challenges. *Third world quarterly*, 21(5), 795-814.